CASE STUDY LEARNING: A TOOL FOR TEACHING CRITICAL THINKING

Lauren Duffy
Associate Professor
Department of Parks, Recreation and Tourism Management
College of Behavioral, Social and Health Sciences
Agenda

- My philosophy towards thinking
- Approach to integrating CT within a course
- Case study learning
- Written Case Analysis Method
- Discussion and lessons learned
- Q & A
THINKING BIG

A process by which we view a set of interrelated parts as a ‘whole rather than seeing them as unrelated components.

A process of moving away from ‘the search of the simple’ to solve complex, interconnected problems of our time.
Integration of critical thinking

Syllabus & Assessment

CT Module (explicit teaching on CT)

5 Case Studies
Integration of critical thinking

- Explicit and transparent
  - CT2 statement
  - CT defined in the syllabus
  - Course objectives reflecting higher order thinking
  - Not a “one off topic” of the course – but the focus of the course

- Lecture, examples, and practice
  - Introduction to CT lecture (1 week)
  - Reading for background context
  - Handouts
    - How to Read Critically
    - A template for problem solving – questions to ask
    - Elements of thought
HOW TO READ CRITICALLY

The key to success in college, in all courses, in all disciplines, is critical reading. Critical reading is concentrated, active, engaged reading. At its core, critical reading involves annotating a text: underlining and writing key words in the margins. Many students do not know how to read critically because they have never been allowed to write in their books. In college, you own the books, so you can finally begin to learn this vital skill. You might worry that you are ruining the book, especially for sale back to the bookstore. However, marking in the book does not decrease its value, and the bookstore doesn’t really give you much money for a used book anyway. Think economically: you are paying a lot to get an education. A real education involves critical reading. If you are not reading critically, annotating all your texts, you are not getting a real education. Would you rather get a few dollars back at the end of the semester, or know that you got the full value of your dollar from your reading? Critical reading is difficult but rewarding. Here are a few steps to help you:

1. FIND A QUIET PLACE TO READ: You must be able to concentrate to read critically. Turn off the TV, throw your roommate out, hide your iPod, turn off your cell phone. Better yet, find a quiet place like the library. You can’t use all your mental capacity if you can’t concentrate.

2. PRE-READ THE ASSIGNMENT: Skim over the whole assignment very quickly. Get a good idea of how much you must read and what it will entail. Pay special attention to chapter
Example Material
Example Material
THE BOYD'S CATERING CASE

Kirsten stopped cleaning the bakery case and looked to make sure that Emily wasn’t watching her.

“Did you hear that Tracy quit yesterday?” she asked.

“Yeah, I couldn’t believe it. Everyone thought she would be manager this summer. Tracy has worked here almost three years longer than any of us. She’ll be a senior this year, so this will be her last summer working here. It was really a shock to her when Mrs. Boyd put Emily in charge.”

“She always seemed to enjoy work until Emily came.”

“Didn’t we all?” I asked.

We both glanced at Emily. She was sitting up front, flipping through a magazine. Margot, Kirsten, and I were all getting ready to close the store. Closing was the worst part of the day, especially now that we had Emily as manager. She had never picked up a broom or washed a dish since she began working in May. I looked at my watch for what must have been the 100th time. Only 10 minutes left. I decided not to sweep the bakery. Emily probably wouldn’t check. As I put the broom away, I realized that two months ago I never would have considered leaving without everything looking perfect for the next day.

While driving home, I tried to figure out why I hated work so much now. I had worked at Boyd’s Catering for two years. Mrs. Boyd always had about five high school and college girls working over the summer. She was very selective about hiring people. She looked for those who would present a good image for the store. We were always very conscientious and took pride in the store and our work.

Mrs. Boyd and her partner, Mrs. Thompson, had opened Boyd’s Catering four years ago. They shocked everyone when they announced they were leaving.

They had plans to open a new restaurant, which would be far more successful than their previous venture. Boyd’s Catering had never been the same since Mrs. Boyd left. The girls who had been hired in her place weren’t the same. I mean, sure, they were good at their jobs, but they didn’t have the same dedication.

I sighed. I was tired. It was time to close the store.
A description of an real-life, administrative/ management situation involving a decision that needs to be made, and is written in such a way that the reader takes the role of the manager, or key decision maker, whose responsibility it is to make that decision to help solve the problem.
- Real-world scenarios in safe environments (Boyce, 1995)
- Multidimensional situations (Boyce, 1995; Scott, 2007; Vaugeois, 2005)
- Unstructured problem-based learning (Scott, 2007)
- Synthesis of information (Boyce, 1995)
- Must think analytically and demonstrate reasoned evidence (Leonard & Cook, 2010)
- Application of theory/concepts (Davis & Wilcock, 2003)
The HBR Process

- Describe
- Analyze
- Generate Alternatives
- Evaluate Alternatives
- Make Recommendations
‘My’ Case Study Process

■ Instruction and Case Introduction
  1. Written case study instructions
  2. Case specific questions
  3. Case study (and teaching note)

■ Two class periods for discussion
  - First class: Focus on concept or theory, background context of the case, problem identification
    ■ Due: Case specific questions
  - Second class: Focus on generating solutions, evaluating solutions, and proposing decisions
    ■ Due: Written case analyses
### Table 1. California Critical Thinking Skills Test (CCTST) sub-domain categories defined.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analytic skills</strong></td>
<td>Ability to gather, organize, synthesize, and scrutinize information and assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inference skills</strong></td>
<td>Ability to generate solutions to a problem, and use information to make sound judgments and/or draw logical conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluation skills</strong></td>
<td>Ability to critique the quality and credibility of sources, arguments, opinions, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Deduction skills</strong></td>
<td>Ability to trace reasoning from the original information presented to a proposed solution that is logical and justified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Induction skills</strong></td>
<td>Ability to make decisions in uncertain and complex situations, where all the facts may not be available, there are many various perspectives to consider, and/or there are a number of different plausible outcomes that result from decisions made; ability to make “educated guesses” based on limited information</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Insight Assessment (2016a).

**The HBR Process**
- Describe
- Analyze
- Generate Alternatives
- Evaluate Alternatives
- Make Recommendations
Discussion

- Labor intensive and take significant class time (Velenchik, 1995)
- Alignment with course objectives and students prepared to engage (Davis & Wilcock, 2003; Vaugeois, 2005)
- Additional readings/content sometimes needed to help frame issues
- Internationality in developing, implementing, monitoring, and assessing
- Oversimplify real-world issues (Leonard & Cook, 2010)
- Class discussion moderation is important (Vaugeois, 2005)
There’s a deep vulnerability involved in case teaching. It can be scary even for experienced faculty to lead case discussions.

(Schiano & Ellet, 2019)
Utilizing Harvard Business Cases

Case Pack

- Case
- Teaching Notes
- Supplementary Materials
- My Coursepack
# Tourism Management - Spring 2016

January 6, 2016 - July 4, 2016

## Fritidsresor Under Pressure (A): The First 10 Hours

- **Author(s):** Joshua D. Margolis, Vincent Dessain, Anders Sjoman
- **Pub Date:** Sep 16, 2006
- **Product #:** 407007-PDF-ENG
- **Discipline:** Organizational Behavior
- **Academic Price:** $4.25

## The Darwinian Workplace

- **Author(s):** Serguei Netessine, Valery Yakubovich
- **Pub Date:** Apr 30, 2012
- **Product #:** F1205A-PDF-ENG
- **Discipline:** Human Resource Management
- **Academic Price:** $4.25

## Managing Online Reviews on TripAdvisor

- **Author(s):** Thales S. Teixeira, Leora Kornfeld
- **Pub Date:** Jan 22, 2013
- **Product #:** 411652-PDF-ENG
- **Discipline:** Information Systems
- **Academic Price:** $4.25
Examples

Main Case  POPULAR
Tesha Motors (in 2013): Will Sparks Fly in the Automobile Industry?
Frank T. Rothaermel; Erin Zimmer
Pub Date: Jan 3, 2014
Product #: M0017-PDF-ENG
Discipline: Strategy
Length: 26 p

Elon Musk's reputation as a serial entrepreneur has people wondering what will happen with his current focus, Tesla Motors. In the heavily-fragmented, altern...

Main Case  POPULAR
Uber and the Ethics of Sharing: Exploring the Societal Promises and Responsibilities of the Sharing Economy
Craig N Smith; Erin McCormick
Pub Date: May 29, 2017
Product #: IN1344-PDF-ENG
Discipline: Business Ethics
Length: 33 p

This case explores the changes wrought by the "sharing economy", examining the innovations and controversies surrounding the online ride-hailing service Uber...

Main Case  OUT FOR REVISION
Walmart: Navigating a Changing Retail Landscape
Michael E. Porter; Jorge Ramirez-Vallejo
Pub Date: Mar 6, 2017
Product #: 717474-PDF-ENG
Discipline: Strategy
Length: 23 p

As the largest company, by revenue, in the world, Walmart has been a lightning rod for criticism. However, in an attempt to stay ahead of traditional and dig...

Learning Objective
"Seaside Organics" is suitable for use in a variety of MBA and/or executive programs. The case focuses on the kinds of tensions that often exist between entrepreneurs and the managers tasked with running their organizations. It can be used in entrepreneurial management, general management, and organizational behavior courses. 1. Explore the tension between the traits and behaviors of entrepreneurs who build and launch new products and services, and of managers who run stable, enduring organizations. 2. Understand how strategies and policies affect a start-up's long-term prospects. 3. Explore how an entrepreneurial organization matures into a successful going concern. 4. Identify circumstances under which it may be advisable for a company's founder to leave the organization.

Details
Pub Date: May 1, 2016
Discipline: Entrepreneurship
Subjects: Personal characteristics, Startup, Decision making, Entrepreneurship, Entrepreneurs, Leadership, Organizational structure, Career advancement, Career changes, Organizational management, Organizational change, Business growth, Manufacturing, Start-ups, Conflict resolution, Strategy
Business foci but topics can transcend...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accounting</th>
<th>Consumer Behavior</th>
<th>Leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Analytics</td>
<td>Decision Making</td>
<td>Pricing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balanced scorecard</td>
<td>Design Thinking</td>
<td>Project Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Big Data</td>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>Social Media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change Management</td>
<td>Internet marketing</td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other sources for case studies

- Acadia Institute of Case Studies (http://aics.acadiau.ca/index.html)
- MIT Sloan School of Management (https://mitsloan.mit.edu/LearningEdge/Pages/Case-Studies.aspx)
- Stanford Graduate School of Business (https://www.gsb.stanford.edu/faculty-research/case-studies/)
Q&A
lduffy@clemson.edu